
MEMORANDUM

TO: Christopher J. Todd, District Superintendent
FROM: Holly Cheeley, Bid Specialist
SUBJECT: Bid Award – Printing Services, B25-5000
DATE: 12/9/2024
CC: Michael Sheperd, Assistant Superintendent for Administrative Service
Gisele Benigno, Coordinator of Business Administration

The Center for Instruction, Technology & Innovation (CiTi) coordinated a cooperative bid for commercial printing services for the participation of CiTi and the following school districts: APW Central School District, Central Square Central School District, Fulton City School District, Hannibal Central School District, Mexico Academy and Central School District, Oswego City School District, Phoenix Central School District, Pulaski Academy and Central School District, and Sandy Creek Central School District.

Printing Services, Bid B25-5000 was released to potential bidders on October 28, 2024. The bid packet and vendor response sheet were emailed directly to twenty-five (25) potential bidders, the bid opportunity appeared on CiTi's public website and the solicitation was posted through BidNet Direct, an online bid distribution and management system. BidNet Direct notified three hundred forty-seven (347) potential suppliers of the bid opportunity. Additionally, a legal notice advertising the bid solicitation appeared in CiTi's legally designated newspaper, the Palladium Times, on October 31, 2024.

Sealed bid responses and also electronic bid responses via BidNet Direct were accepted for Bid B25-5000 until 1:30 p.m. on November 21, 2024 and a public bid opening was held at that time and made available virtually via Zoom. A total of nine (9) vendors responded to solicitation B25-5000. Three (3) bidders submitted a hardcopy, sealed response and the other six (6) bidders submitted an electronic response via BidNet Direct.

A BOARD OF COOPERATIVE EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

179 County Route 64, Mexico, NY 13114
Christopher J. Todd, District Superintendent/Executive Officer

Twenty-nine (29) line items covering five (5) different types of printing projects were solicited on the bid. Each type of project is represented as a lot on the bid. The lots are as follows:

- Lot A: Newsletters
- Lot B: Letterhead
- Lot C1: #10 & #9 Printed Envelopes
- Lot C2: Printed Envelopes
- Lot D: Catalog

It is not a requirement for each bidder to respond with pricing for each lot. The following chart is a lot-by-lot summary of how each of the nine (9) bidders responded to Printing Services Bid B25-5000. An "X" indicates that the bidder responded with pricing for that lot.

Bidders	Lot A: Newsletters	Lot B: Letterhead	Lot C1: #10 & #9 Printed Envelopes	Lot C2: Printed Envelopes	Lot D: Catalog
Avalon	X	X	X	X	X
Brigar XPress Solutions (dba Digital Press)	X	X	X	X	X
Checkomatic, Inc.	-	-	X	X	-
Courier Printing Corp.	X	-	X	X	X
Freeport Press	-	-	-	-	X
KM Media Group (dba JDS Graphics)	X	X	X	X	X
Indiana Printing & Publishing Co., Inc.	X	X	X	X	X
Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics Corp.)	X	X	X	X	X
Mitchell Printing & Mailing, Inc.	X	X	-	-	-

The bid solicitation reserved the right to award in a lot-by-lot manner based on the following methods:

- Lot A: Newsletters – To one (1) responsive, responsible bidder based on best value.
- Lot B: Letterhead – To the lowest responsive, responsible bidder that can meet the terms, standard production time* and specifications outlined for this project type.

A BOARD OF COOPERATIVE EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

179 County Route 64, Mexico, NY 13114
Christopher J. Todd, District Superintendent/Executive Officer

- Lot C1: #10 & #9 Printed Envelopes – To the lowest responsive, responsible bidder that can meet the terms, standard production time* and specifications outlined for this project type.
- Lot C2: Printed Envelopes – To the lowest responsive, responsible bidder that can meet the terms, standard production time* and specifications outlined for this project type.
- Lot D: Catalog – To the lowest responsive, responsible bidder that can meet the terms and specifications outlined for this project type.

**Standard production time was outlined in the bid packet for newsletters, letterhead and envelopes. This is defined as the time when the completed project is to be delivered and accepted at the address specified on the purchase order. Each bidder was given an opportunity to define their standard production time on their bid response.*

The following pages are a lot-by-lot tabulation of the bid responses that were received for Printing Services Bid B25-5000.

A BOARD OF COOPERATIVE EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

179 County Route 64, Mexico, NY 13114
Christopher J. Todd, District Superintendent/Executive Officer

LOT A: NEWSLETTERS

Lot A consisted of six (6) different newsletter jobs. For each of the six (6) line items, the bidders were asked to provide a cost per thousand for the order size assumptions identified on the bid. Bidders were also asked to identify any delivery charges for the identified order size and to state their standard production time for this project type. The bid-defined standard production time for this project type is seven (7) business days from proof approval. Bidders were also asked to define their delivery method whether it be via company truck or a commercial carrier such as FedEx or UPS. The lot price in the following chart was calculated using each bidder's quoted price for their standard production time for one (1) order of each of the order size assumptions on the bid. The price also includes any applicable shipping and delivery charges.

The bid reserved the right to award Lot A to the one (1) bidder that earned the highest score based on the following best value criteria:

Price = 50 points maximum

50 Points = Lowest bidder

48 Points = Second lowest bidder

46 Points = Third lowest bidder

44 Points = Fourth lowest bidder

42 Points = All other bidders

Standard Delivery Time = 25 points maximum

25 Points = Bidders that can meet/exceed the standard delivery time for this project type.

21 Points = Bidders that respond with a standard delivery time of 8 to 10 days.

17 Points = Bidders that respond with a standard delivery time of 11 or more days.

Delivery Method = 25 points maximum

25 Points = Bidders that will deliver via company truck or personal delivery.

18 Points = Bidders that will deliver via FedEx, UPS or other similar commercial carrier.

A BOARD OF COOPERATIVE EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

179 County Route 64, Mexico, NY 13114

Christopher J. Todd, District Superintendent/Executive Officer

LOT A: NEWSLETTERS								
Bidders	Number of Line Items Bid:	Standard Production Time:	Score:	Delivery Method:	Score:	Lot Price:	Score:	TOTAL SCORE
Avalon	6	5 Days	25	<i>Company Vehicle, UPS or FedEx</i>	18	\$62,610.75	42	85
Brigar Xpress Solutions (dba Digital Press)	6	10-12 Days	17	<i>FedEx, UPS</i>	18	\$27,003.62	46	81
Checkomatic, Inc	NO BID							
Courier Printing Corporation	6	10 Days	21	<i>Company Vehicle</i>	25	\$20,370.10	48	94
Freeport Press	NO BID							
Indiana Printing & Publishing Co., Inc.	6	7 Days	25	<i>FedEx or Company Vehicle</i>	18	\$32,881.01	42	85
KM Media Group (dba JDS Graphics)	6	5 Days	25	<i>FedEx or Courier</i>	18	\$28,857.85	42	85
Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics Corp.)	6	7 Days	25	<i>Rist Transportation</i>	18	\$28,004.45	44	87
Mitchell Printing & Mailing, Inc.	6	5 Days	25	<i>Company Vehicle</i>	25	\$19,918.40	50	100

Lot A Analysis and Award Recommendation: The highest scoring bidder for this lot was Mitchell Printing & Mailing, Inc. with a score of 100. It is recommended that Lot A be awarded to Mitchell Printing & Mailing, Inc.

A BOARD OF COOPERATIVE EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

179 County Route 64, Mexico, NY 13114
Christopher J. Todd, District Superintendent/Executive Officer

LOT B: LETTERHEAD

For this lot the bidders were asked to provide a cost per thousand for a letterhead order for the following order quantity assumptions: 1 to 2,500; 2,501 to 5,000; 5,001 to 7,500; and 7,501 and over. Bidders were also asked to identify any delivery charges for the order quantity assumptions and to state their standard production time for this project type. The bid-defined standard production time for this project type is seven (7) business days from proof approval. The bid reserved the right to award the lot to the lowest responsive, responsible bidder (one [1] vendor) that can meet the terms, standard production time and specifications outlined for this project type. The lot price in the following chart was calculated using each bidder's quoted price per thousand for their standard production time for an order of letterhead at the following quantities: 1,000; 3,000, 6,000; and 8,000.

Bidders	Standard Production Time:	Lot Price for Standard Production Time:
Avalon	3 Days	\$10,978.38
Brigar Xpress Solutions (dba Digital Press)	5 Days	\$4,975.09
Checkomatic, Inc.	NO BID	
Courier Printing Corporation	NO BID	
Freeport Press	NO BID	
Indiana Printing & Publishing Co., Inc.	10 Days	\$1,886.41
KM Media Group (dba JDS Graphics)	7 Days	\$2,550.00
Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics)	7 Days	\$2,032.74
Mitchell Printing & Mailing, Inc.	5 Days	\$2,078.00

Lot B Analysis and Award Recommendation: Indiana Printing & Publishing Co., Inc. responded with the lowest price for this lot at \$1,886.41 but cannot meet the standard production time identified for this project type. Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics) was the second lowest bidder and can complete this project type within the bid-defined standard production time. It is recommended that Lot B be awarded to Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics).

A BOARD OF COOPERATIVE EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

179 County Route 64, Mexico, NY 13114
Christopher J. Todd, District Superintendent/Executive Officer

LOT C1: #10 and #9 PRINTED ENVELOPES

Lot C1 consisted of ten (10) different #10 and #9 printed envelope jobs. For each of the line items the bidders were asked to provide a cost per thousand for the following order size assumptions: 1,000; 5,000; and 10,000. Bidders were also asked to identify any delivery charges for the identified order size categories and to state their standard production time for this project type. The bid-defined standard production time for this project type is ten (10) business days from proof approval. The bid reserved the right to award the lot to the lowest responsive, responsible bidder (one [1] vendor) that can meet the terms, standard production time and specifications outlined for his project type. The lot price in the following chart was calculated using each bidder's quoted price per thousand for their standard production time for one (1) order of 1,000; 5,000; and 10,000 for each line item.

Bidders	Number of Line Items Bid:	Standard Production Time:	Price of the Nine (9) Items in Common:	Price for ten (10) Items Except Quantity 1,000 on (1) One Item	Lot Price for Standard Production Time for All Line Items:
Avalon	10	3 Days	\$19,531.01	\$22,606.01	\$22,811.01
Brigar XPress Solutions (dba Digital Press)	10	7-10 Days except for one line item which is 12-15 days	\$18,042.83	\$20,308.84	\$20,634.46
Checkomatic, Inc.	10	7-10 Days	\$10,371.45	\$11,276.70	\$11,390.45
Courier Printing Corporation	1	10 Days	N/A	N/A	N/A
Freeport Press	NO BID				
Indiana Printing & Publishing Co., Inc.	10	10 Days	\$9,693.16	\$10,804.33	\$10,907.68
KM Media Group (dba JDS Graphics)	10	9 Days	\$18,627.00	\$20,637.00	\$20,880.00
Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope and Graphics)	10*	10 Days	\$8,699.00	\$9,908.25	N/A
Mitchell Printing & Mailing	NO BID				

*Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope and Graphics) did not bid on a quantity of 1,000 for one (1) line item.

A BOARD OF COOPERATIVE EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

179 County Route 64, Mexico, NY 13114
Christopher J. Todd, District Superintendent/Executive Officer

Lot C1 Analysis and Award Recommendation: Seven (7) bidders responded with pricing for this lot and (6) six bidders could meet or exceed the standard production time identified for this project type. Courier Printing Corporation bid on one (1) of the ten (10) line items in the lot. Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics) did not bid on quantity of 1,000 for one (1) line item. The other five (5) bidders bid on all ten (10) line items in this lot. For analysis purposes the chart on the previous page contains a column comparing the nine (9) line items that six (6), bidders bid on in common. Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics) is offering the most advantageous pricing for the nine (9) common line items. The chart also contains a column for all common lines except for the quantity of 1,000 that Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics) did not bid. Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics) is offering the most advantageous pricing for these common items as well. It is recommended that Lot C1 be awarded to Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics).

A BOARD OF COOPERATIVE EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

179 County Route 64, Mexico, NY 13114
Christopher J. Todd, District Superintendent/Executive Officer

LOT C2: PRINTED ENVELOPES

Lot C2 consisted of eleven (11) different printed envelope jobs. For each of the line items the bidders were asked to provide a cost per thousand for the following order size assumptions: 1,000; 5,000; and 10,000. Bidders were also asked to identify any delivery charges for the identified order size categories and to state their standard production time for this project type. The bid defined the standard production time for this project type as ten (10) business days from proof approval. The bid reserved the right to award the lot to the lowest responsive, responsible bidder (one [1] vendor) that can meet the terms, standard production time and specifications outlined for his project type. The lot price in the following chart was calculated using each bidder's quoted price per thousand for their standard production time for one (1) order of 1,000; 5,000; and 10,000 for each line item.

Bidders	Number of Line Items Bid:	Standard Production Time:	Price of the nine (9) Items in Common:	Lot Price for All Line Items:
Avalon	11	3 Days	\$44,822.94	\$49,765.50
Brigar Xpress Solutions (dba Digital Press)	11	7-10 Days <i>Except two of the line items which would be 4-5 weeks</i>	\$33,986.48	\$44,320.45
Checkomatic, Inc	11	7-10 Days	\$23,304.30	\$28,070.10
Courier Printing Corporation	5	10 Days	N/A	N/A
Freeport Press	NO BID			
Indiana Printing and Publishing	11	10 Days	\$25,210.67	\$31,013.96
KM Media Group (dba JDS Graphics)	11	9 Days	\$27,430.00	\$34,975.00
Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope &	9	10 Days	\$21,754.00	N/A
Mitchell Printing & Mailing, Inc.	NO BID			

A BOARD OF COOPERATIVE EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

179 County Route 64, Mexico, NY 13114
Christopher J. Todd, District Superintendent/Executive Officer

Lot C2 Analysis and Award Recommendation: Six (6) of the seven (7) bidders that responded with pricing for this lot could meet or exceed the standard production time identified for this project type. One (1) bidder, Brigar Xpress Solutions (dba Digital Press) responded with a production time for certain line items in the lot that well exceeded the 10-day production time outlined in the bid. One (1) bidder, Courier Printing Corporation, bid on less than 50% of line items. One (1) bidder, Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics), bid on nine (9) of the eleven (11) line items in the lot and the other four (4) bidders bid on all eleven (11) line items in this lot. For analysis purposes the chart on the previous page contains a column comparing the nine (9) line items that six (6) of the bidders bid on in common. Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics) is the lowest bidder for both the nine (9) common line items. It is recommended that Lot C2 be awarded to Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics).

A BOARD OF COOPERATIVE EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

179 County Route 64, Mexico, NY 13114
Christopher J. Todd, District Superintendent/Executive Officer

LOT D: CATALOG

Lot D requested pricing for the printing of one (1) 28-page catalog as well as the mail preparation and mail processing services for the catalog. Additionally, bidders were asked to outline their standard delivery time to complete the job and their hourly rate for file manipulation services. Standard delivery time or production time is the number of days that the bidder would need to complete the printing job solicited. File manipulation services are the services of a bidder's in-house graphic designer. The bid reserved the right to award the lot to the lowest responsive, responsible bidder (one [1] vendor) that can meet the terms and specifications outlined for his project type.

Bidders	Finished Size	Standard Delivery Time from Proof Approval	File Manipulation Services Cost per Hour	Bid Price Cost per 1,000	Mail Prep* Cost per piece	GRAND TOTAL For 72,000 Copies
Avalon	8.5 x 11	10 Business Days	\$125.00	\$1,943.97	\$0.10	\$147,165.84
Brigar Xpress Solutions (dba Digital Press)	8.5 x 11	15 Business Days	\$125.00	\$644.63	\$0.0878	\$52,734.96
Checkomatic, Inc.	NO BID					
Courier Printing Corporation	8.5 x 11	10 Business Days	\$25.00	\$603.00	<i>Included in bid price</i>	\$43,416.00
Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics)	8.5 x 11	15 Business Days	\$80.00	\$958.50	\$0.049	\$72,540.00
Freeport Press	8.5 x 10.75	10 Business Days	N/A	\$352.00	\$0.03	\$27,504.00
Indiana Printing & Publishing Co.,	8.5 x 11	10 Business Days	\$75.00	\$622.62	\$0.03	\$46,988.64
KM Media Group (dba JDS Graphics)	8.5 x 11	7 Business Days	\$100.00	\$489.00	\$0.055	\$39,168.00
Mitchell Printing & Mailing, Inc.	NO BID					

**Mail Prep Services does not include USPS postage charges to mail the catalog.*

A BOARD OF COOPERATIVE EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

179 County Route 64, Mexico, NY 13114
Christopher J. Todd, District Superintendent/Executive Officer

Lot D Analysis and Award Recommendation: The seven (7) bidders that submitted a pricing proposal met the qualifications to be considered for an award and were deemed responsive, responsible bidders. Freeport Press submitted the lowest bid response for this lot at \$27,504.00 for printing and mail preparation services. It is recommended that Lot D be awarded to Freeport Press.

Award Recommendation:

Lot/Project Type	Awarded Vendor
Lot A: Newsletters	Mitchell Printing & Mailing, Inc.
Lot B: Letterhead	Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics)
Lot C1: #9 & #10 Printed Envelopes	Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics)
Lot C2: Printed Envelopes	Matt Industries (dba Dupli Envelope & Graphics).
Lot D: Catalog	Freeport Press

It is recommended that the Printing Services Bid B25-5000, with a contract date from February 1, 2025 to January 31, 2026 be awarded to the vendors as indicated on the above chart.

Award Amount: *There is no estimated award amount for this bid. The pricing on the charts herein was calculated using the vendor's price per project and last year's quantities and number of projects printed. Actual purchases for the upcoming award period will be determined based on the number of projects requested and the actual order size of each project.*

A BOARD OF COOPERATIVE EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

179 County Route 64, Mexico, NY 13114
Christopher J. Todd, District Superintendent/Executive Officer